

The Centre for the Study of Manuscript Cultures  
Universität Hamburg

**From East to West:  
Christian Literacy in the First Millennium**

DeLiCaTe Workshop on  
Palaeography and Lectionaries

Monday, 18 March 2024, 9:00 am – 6:25 pm CET

Tuesday, 19 March 2024, 9:15 am – 5:15 pm CET

Warburgstraße 26, 20354 Hamburg

Organised by Emilio Bonfiglio, Jost Gippert, Mariam  
Kamarauli, and Eka Kvirkvelia (Universität Hamburg)

Registration:

<https://www.csmc.uni-hamburg.de/en/register/workshop53>

The creation of specific alphabetic scripts in the context of Christianisation in the early 5th century CE meant the beginning of literacy for three distinct ethnic groups in the Southern Caucasus: Armenians, Georgians, and the so-called ‘Caucasian Albanians’. The development of these scripts during the subsequent centuries and the textual heritage preserved from those times are the object of the ERC project ‘DeLiCaTe’ (‘The Development of Literacy in the Caucasian Territories’) hosted at the CSMC since 2022. The present workshop is intended to put the Caucasian traditions in a wider context by focussing on the usage and evolution of majuscule letters as prevalent in most of the contemporary Christian manuscript cultures (Greek, Latin, Coptic, Gothic, etc.), and lectionaries, i.e. books containing the Biblical lections for liturgical use, as one of the most prominent type of manuscripts that were produced.

## Programme

---

### Monday, 18 March 2024, 9:00 am – 6:25 pm

9:00 – 9:15 Jost Gippert (Universität Hamburg)  
*Welcome and Introduction*

#### Part I: Palaeography – Majuscules and Their Development

##### Session 1

Chair: Jost Gippert (Universität Hamburg)

9:15 – 10:00 Giuseppe De Gregorio (Alma Mater Studiorum – University of Bologna)  
*“Se non è vero, è molto ben trovato”. Some Remarks on Greek Majuscule Handwritings*

10:00 – 10:45 Alin Suciu (Göttingen Academy of Sciences)  
*New Perspectives on the Paleography of Coptic Literary Manuscripts: Survey of Datable Book Hands and their Historical Development*

10:45 – 11:15 Coffee break

##### Session 2

Chair: Konrad Hirschler (Universität Hamburg)

11:15 – 12:00 Peter Stokes (École pratique des hautes études, Paris)  
*Majuscules in Britain and Ireland from the Sixth to the Eleventh Century*

12:00 – 12:45 Carla Falluomini (University of Perugia)  
*The Gothic Script between Greek and Latin Models*

12:45 – 2:15 Lunch

##### Session 3

Chair: Mariam Kamarauli (Universität Hamburg)

2:15 – 3:00 Dali Chitunashvili (Korneli Kekelidze Georgian National Centre of Manuscripts, Tbilisi)  
*Palaeography as a Basis for the Dating of Manuscripts (Georgian Asomtavruli)*

3:00 – 3:40 Emilio Bonfiglio (Universität Hamburg)  
*New Manuscript Evidence for the Development of the Armenian Majuscule Script*

3:40 – 4:00 Coffee Break

## **PART II: The DeLiCaTe Approach to Lectionaries**

### **Session 4**

Chair: Caroline Macé (Universität Hamburg)

4:00 – 4:40 Hasmik Sargsyan and Jost Gippert (Universität Hamburg)  
*Armenian Lectionaries: Types and Developments*

4:40 – 5:20 Eka Kvirkvelia (Universität Hamburg)  
*Georgian Witnesses of the Jerusalem-rite Lectionary: Structures and Developments*

5:20 – 6:00 Mariam Kamarauli (Universität Hamburg)  
*News from Paris: Updates on Paris, BnF, georg. 5*

6:00 – 6:30 Sandro Tskhvedadze (Universität Hamburg)  
*Georgian Gospel Lectionaries: Comparative Approaches*

7:30 Dinner

## **Tuesday, 19 March 2024, 9:15 am – 5:15 pm**

### **PART III: Lectionaries: Pericopes and Liturgy**

#### **Session 1**

Chair: Jost Gippert (Universität Hamburg)

9:15 – 10:00 Daniel Galadza (Pontificio Istituto Orientale, Rome)  
*Re-Examining the Jerusalem and Byzantine Pericope Orders of the Greek Lectionary*

10:00 – 10:45 Ugo Zanetti (Monastère de Chevetogne)  
*Les lectionnaires coptes*

10:45 – 11:15 Coffee Break

#### **Session 2**

Chair: Emilio Bonfiglio (Universität Hamburg)

11:15 – 12:00 Christa Müller-Kessler (Friedrich-Schiller-Universität Jena)  
*The Old Jerusalem Lectionary in Christian Palestinian Aramaic as the Earliest Attested Witness*

12:00 – 12:45 Grigory Kessel (Austrian Academy of Sciences)  
*Preliminary Observations on the Reception of the Jerusalem Lectionary in the Chalcedonian Syriac Milieu*

12:45 – 2:15 Lunch

### Session 3

Chair: Hasmik Sargsyan (Universität Hamburg)

2:15 – 3:00 Daniel Stökl Ben Ezra (École pratique des hautes études, Paris)  
*Automatic Transcription and Indexing of Lectionary Manuscripts [The ThALES Project]*

3:00 – 3:45 Harald Buchinger (Universität Regensburg)  
*Jerusalem in the West: Traces of Reception and Resistance in Latin Lectionaries*

3:45 – 4:15 Coffee Break

### Session 4

Chair: Eka Kvirkvelia (Universität Hamburg)

4:15 – 5:00 Bernard Outtier (Bibliothèque du Caucase, Lavau)  
*Less-Known Lists and Indications of Lessons of the Older Georgian Lectionary*

5:00 – 5:15 Emilio Bonfiglio and Eka Kvirkvelia (Universität Hamburg)  
*Summary, Concluding Remarks, and Farewell*

## Abstracts and Contributors

---

### **Giuseppe De Gregorio (Alma Mater Studiorum, University of Bologna)**

*'Se non è vero, è molto ben trovato'. Some Remarks on Greek Majuscule Handwritings*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 9:15 am – 10:00 am

'Even if it is not true, it is very well conceived' – this aphorism by the late Italian Renaissance philosopher Tommaso Campanella serves to mark a brief methodological overview involving the historical development of Greek majuscule handwritings in late antiquity and early Byzantine era, starting from the 3rd/4th century until around the 10th century. Palaeography and clues coming from other disciplines are compared, in order to gain more or less certain footholds and sustainable chronologies for witnesses mainly in Biblical majuscule, but also in Alexandrian and sloping pointed majuscules.

---

### **Alin Suci (Göttingen Academy of Sciences)**

*New Perspectives on the Paleography of Coptic Literary Manuscripts: Survey of Datable Book Hands and their Historical Development*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 10:00 am – 10:45 am

Although Coptic manuscript culture emerges in the 4th century CE, the earliest dated Coptic literary manuscripts do not appear until the 9th century CE. This situation greatly complicates any attempt to establish a viable typology for the development of Coptic handwriting styles before the 9th century CE. Using a variety of dating criteria, this paper surveys the datable Coptic literary hands from the 4th to the 8th centuries CE and proposes some desiderata for further research in Coptic palaeography.

---

### **Peter Stokes (École pratique des hautes études, Paris)**

*Majuscules in Britain and Ireland from the Sixth to the Eleventh Century*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 11:15 am – 12:00 am

One of the striking elements of writing in early mediaeval Britain and Ireland is the range of different scripts that were used, including both majuscule and minuscule forms. Julian Brown identified five grades of script written in those islands up until the mid-ninth century, of which one had already been labelled 'Insular Majuscule' by E.A. Lowe, although the degree to which it is truly majuscule has since been questioned. To these one can add the unambiguously

majuscule Square, Rustic and Uncial scripts which seem to have been imported (or more likely reimported) first into England and subsequently to Wales, Scotland and Ireland from the end of the sixth century. We therefore find manuscripts and charters written entirely in these majuscule scripts, as well as other cases where majuscule forms are used for particular sections or purposes. This situation was not stable throughout the period to be considered, however, but developed seemingly due to a combination of gradual drift in practice and more sudden changes which can usually be linked to external factors such as invasion (from Danes and then Normans), reform (such as the monastic reforms in England in the mid-tenth century), and other forms of contact, including movements across the Channel to as far afield as Rome or even Mt Sinai. This paper will therefore illustrate these different developments in the use and form of majuscule scripts, considering the impact of external factors, but will also briefly address issues around the definition of 'majuscule', particularly in the context of more ambiguous cases such as 'Insular majuscule', the so-called *diminuendo* that is characteristic of early Insular script, and the use of majuscule letter-forms in otherwise minuscule contexts.

---

**Carla Falluomini (University of Perugia)**

*The Gothic Script between Greek and Latin Models*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 12:00 am – 12:45 am

The script of the Goths, devised by the Gothic bishop Wulfila in the mid-fourth century, is primarily based on the Greek alphabet, with some letters derived from the Latin alphabet and others from the runes (although the precise origin of some Gothic letters remains unclear). These three script systems were in use in the territories where Wulfila, together with the group of Goths – known as *Gothi minores* – of which he was a religious and political leader, lived, namely ancient Dacia and, from 347/348, Moesia Inferior. The preference for the Greek alphabet was probably motivated by the strong influence of the Constantinopolitan Church and by the desire to emphasise close connection with Greek Christian culture. The alterations made to the Greek script, including the incorporation of letters of different origin to form a new alphabet, could have been motivated by the Gothic phonetic system, as well as by the deliberate or unintentional effort to create a new and distinctive identity for the Christian Goths within the Roman Empire. The surviving Gothic fragmentary *codices*, however, were copied at least a hundred and fifty years after the original manuscripts, having been produced in Ostrogothic Italy. Few written witnesses are of other origin, and none is from Wulfila's period.

This paper aims to show the characteristics of the Gothic script and the influence of Greek and Latin models on this peculiar, contained tradition, which extends from the mid-fourth to the mid-sixth century. Although its analysis is limited by the nature of the surviving written records, it is possible to assume that these witnesses preserve graphic forms that may be considered of

Wulfilian origin, with some exceptions that are due to the Latin influence and the natural evolution of the script.

---

**Jürgen Fuchsbauer (Leopold-Franzens-Universität Innsbruck)**

*The Development of the Two Slavonic Scripts – Glagolitic and Cyrillic With a Special Focus on Majuscule Forms*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 2:15 pm – 3:00 pm

Church Slavonic was written in two scripts. The first, Glagolitic, is the creation of Constantine the Philosopher, known by his monastic name Cyril, and his brother Methodius. It was developed in Constantinople in 862 for the translation of central religious texts into Slavonic in preparation of a mission to the so-called Moravian Empire. From Moravia, Glagolitic spread to Bulgaria and Croatia, where it was in use until the recent past and developed into a “national script”. When Glagolitic was transferred to Bulgaria in 885/6, the literate elite of the country used the Greek script. Under the influence of Glagolitic, the second Slavonic script, Cyrillic, evolved from the Greek script.

In spite of being influenced by the Greek minuscule of its time, Glagolitic had a markedly majuscule character, much of which it retained throughout its history. By contrast, Cyrillic evolved from a Greek majuscule. Yet, it soon developed characteristics of a minuscule script. My lecture gives an overview of the development of Glagolitic and Cyrillic, with a focus on majuscule forms.

---

**Dali Chitunashvili (Korneli Kekelidze Georgian National Centre of Manuscripts, Tbilisi)**

*Palaeography as a Basis for the Dating of Manuscripts (Georgian Asomtavruli)*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 3:00 pm – 3:45 pm

Paleography is a complex field. Last year, we already had the opportunity to discuss the principles of dating palimpsests, during which we identified three main criteria – Xanmetoba-Haemetoba – that place inscriptions and manuscripts between the 5th and 8th centuries; the closed loops of certain graphemes (ღ, ყ, ი, ჯ, ზ, თ, and ძ); as well as textology as the primary criterion.

Today, we will once again delve into palaeography, focusing on graphics and grapheme outlines. We'll explore the trends and types of changes in graphemes found in ancient Georgian manuscripts dating from the 5th to the 10th centuries. By examining these changes in outlines, we aim to identify trends that can aid in dating undated manuscripts.

Much has been written about the graphics of the Georgian Asomtavruli alphabet, particularly focusing on the geometric principles underlying the construction of Asomtavruli graphemes. This enduring principle involves all Asomtavruli graphemes being constructed within a two-line grid, forming a square, and maintaining a consistent height. They are positioned between vertical and horizontal lines, with the main graphic elements being lines, circles, and semicircles (arcs). The majority of letters are aligned along the vertical axis, with a circle or semicircle occupying space to the left or right.

This principle is easy to grasp when examining the entire alphabet, except for the grapheme ‘Jan’, which serves as an anagram of ‘Christ’. Similar to the Greek anagram, the graphemes ‘i’ and ‘k’ are positioned diagonally across each other.

However, how solid are these criteria, and does palaeography alone allow us to date manuscripts?

---

**Emilio Bonfiglio (Universität Hamburg, DeLiCaTe ERC Project)**

*New Manuscript Evidence for the Development of the Armenian Majuscule Script.*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 3:45 pm – 4:15 pm

Armenians produced manuscripts since the invention of the Armenian script, in the first decade of the fifth century ce. In spite of all hazards, man-made catastrophes, and natural disasters, some 31.000 Armenian manuscripts that were produced during the mediaeval, early modern, and modern epochs are still extant nowadays, even if now scattered in private collections, public and monastic libraries around the four corners of the world. Throughout this long history of manuscript-book making, the Armenians devised a variety of scripts, which have been the object of scholarly attention since the nineteenth century. While the twenty-first century has witnessed an increase in the study of Armenian palaeography, most of the relevant publications has focussed nearly exclusively on dated manuscripts, leaving aside material belonging to the fifth to ninth century and, especially, palimpsests. The aim of this paper is to revisit and problematise the earliest manuscript material and what is often considered the earliest of such scripts—namely the erk’atagir or Armenian majuscule—by utilising hitherto unknown or unstudied material that stems from new evidence brought to light within the DeLiCaTe ERC project.



**Hasmik Sargsyan and Jost Gippert (Universität Hamburg, DeLiCaTe ERC Project)**

*Armenian Lectionaries: Types and Developments*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 4:45 pm – 5:15 pm

The paper examines the historical development of lectionaries in the Armenian tradition on the basis of the detailed investigations by Charles Renoux. After introducing the four stages outlined by the latter author, we discuss some recently investigated palimpsests which prove the existence of a hitherto unknown type of lectionaries combining Biblical pericopes with saints' legends and which shed new light on the question of the dating of Armenian palimpsests written in majuscules.

---

**Eka Kvirkvelia (Universität Hamburg, DeLiCaTe ERC Project)**

*Georgian Witnesses of the Jerusalem-rite Lectionary: Structures and Developments*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 5:15 pm – 5:45 pm

The paper discusses the development of the Georgian Jerusalem-rite lectionaries, which remained in use until the 11th century. Drawing on existing studies and research conducted within the project “The Development of Literacy in the Caucasian Territories (DeLiCaTe)”, the paper examines the types of Georgian lectionaries based on detailed investigations of their composition.

In addition to the extensive list of manuscripts known thus far, newly revealed palimpsests have shown up, offering significant material for studying the development of Jerusalem-type lectionaries. Incorporating this new data, the interrelation of existing sources and the structural patterns of daily service will also be discussed in the paper.

---

**Mariam Kamarauli (Universität Hamburg, DeLiCaTe ERC Project)**

*News from Paris: Updates on Paris, BnF, géorg. 5*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 5:45 pm – 6:05 pm

The presentation will provide an update on our work on the palimpsest Paris, BnF, géorg. 5. Since the beginning of the “DeLiCaTe” project, our team has been working on the lectionary comprised in the lower layer of the manuscript, some folios of which were unreadable. After a mission to Paris in 2023, new insights came to light with the multispectral images taken which provided significant differences to our previous analysis. After introducing both the upper and the lower

layer of the palimpsest, I will discuss the new insights and changes concerning the structure of the quires and their contents.

---

**Sandro Tskhvedadze (Universität Hamburg)**

*Georgian Gospel Lectionaries: Comparative Approaches*

Monday, 18 March 2024, 6:05 pm – 6:25 pm

The presentation aims to illustrate recent approaches to the earliest stages of the chronological development of Georgian Gospel Lectionary manuscripts of the Constantinopolitan Rite. These manuscripts contain Gospel pericopes intended for liturgical use and are dated to the introduction of the Constantinopolitan Rite (around the 11th–12th centuries). I will provide preliminary results from a comparison of several of the existing manuscripts, investigating their origins, production, codicological structures and differences, and the exchange between different locations of Georgian monastic communities they witness to. These locations include the Iviron Monastery on Mount Athos, St. Catherine’s Monastery on Mount Sinai, and various places within the mediaeval Georgian kingdom. According to this approach, the manuscripts can be divided into two major groups, one reflecting the Pre-Athonite tradition and the other one, the Athonite tradition. During the subsequent centuries, the latter became regarded as the Georgian Vulgate and was adopted by Georgian monasteries both within the Georgian kingdom and beyond its borders. Despite belonging to almost the same chronological period, these manuscripts display significant diversity in terms of their structural patterns, liturgical traditions, and other relevant characteristics.

---

**Daniel Galadza (Pontificio Istituto Orientale, Rome)**

*Re-Examining the Jerusalem and Byzantine Pericope Orders of the Greek Lectionary*

Tuesday, 19 March 2024, 9:15 am – 10:00 am

Kurt Aland’s second edition of the *Kurzgefaßte Liste der griechischen Handschriften des Neuen Testaments* published in 1994 lists the number of Greek New Testament lectionaries as over 2,403 in number. The pericope order of this vast quantity of manuscripts has been generally labelled as ‘Byzantine’, with notes in the apparatus indicating that a ‘Jerusalem pericope order’ can be detected in about 16 of these manuscripts. This paper intends to delve deeper into the classifications of the ‘Byzantine’ and ‘Jerusalem’ pericope orders of Gospel lectionaries by examining three categories of Greek manuscripts thus far identified in scholarship: (1) the general ‘Byzantine’ order, providing a general overview of the current research on this classification; (2) the Greek manuscripts of the ‘Jerusalem’ pericope order (which will be the core

of this paper), presenting descriptions of all the manuscripts thus far identified as reflecting the 'Jerusalem pericope order', the majority of which are from the Sinai New Finds collection and remain unedited and insufficiently described; and (3) the Greek manuscripts of the Constantinopolitan patriarchal Gospel lectionary type. The paper will conclude with a presentation of certain Greek lectionary manuscripts that do not fit neatly into these three categories and raise questions about the need for revising classifications and proposing new categories in the study of Greek lectionaries.

---

### **Ugo Zanetti (Monastère de Chevetogne)**

*Les lectionnaires coptes*

Tuesday, 19 March 2024, 10:00 am – 10:45 am

After a general introduction about lectionary manuscripts and how to study them, the lectionary of the Coptic Church will be explained according to its present practice. Lower Egypt manuscripts of the second millennium show that some other systems existed in the past, but were never printed, and we shall see how they worked. As for the first millennium and for Upper Egypt, the documents are rare and scattered, so that we cannot by now completely describe the different liturgical calendars which existed, but it is possible to outline their system, and we hope that ongoing research will enable us to increase our knowledge. The situation is different for Nubia, for which we have only five very partial witnesses, not agreeing with each other, but we can at least see that its lectionary system was built on the same model than that of Upper Egypt, not however without other influences.

---

### **Christa Müller-Kessler (Friedrich-Schiller-Universität Jena)**

*The Old Jerusalem Lectionary in Christian Palestinian Aramaic as the Earliest Attested Witness*

Tuesday, 19 March 2024, 11:15 am – 12:00 am

The extant sources of the Old Jerusalem Lectionary in Christian Palestinian Aramaic have been neglected since by the publications of Agnes Smith Lewis in 1909 and Francis Crawford Burkitt in 1923 attention was drawn to the fact of its existence. Despite its fragmentary state it can be considered to be the earliest witness (5th to 7th cent.) even preceding the Armenian transmission. It can be postulated that Cyril of Jerusalem (d. 388) as influential bishop of his time initiated its translation from Greek into this Western Aramaic vernacular after introducing it as a written literary language for lower clerical purposes. The witnesses have come down to us only in the form of palimpsests with Christian Palestinian Aramaic as *scriptio inferior* under Georgian, Greek, Hebrew, and Syriac script.

**Grigory Kessel (Austrian Academy of Sciences)**

*Preliminary Observations on the Reception of the Jerusalem Lectionary in the Chalcedonian Syriac Milieu*

Tuesday, 19 March 2024, 12:00 am – 12:45 am

As it is well-known, the ancient lectionary of the Church of Jerusalem has not survived in its entirety in Greek, but is attested by its Armenian and Georgian versions. Whereas a vast majority of Melkite Syriac liturgical manuscripts betray a full-scale Byzantinization, there are some liturgical manuscripts that have preserved various liturgical texts pertaining to the Jerusalem rite. In my presentation I will offer a preliminary survey of the extant manuscripts that have been neglected in the earlier scholarship and will make an attempt to relate the Syriac version to other versions through the comparison of some of its salient features.

---

**Harald Buchinger (Universität Regensburg)**

*Jerusalem in the West: Traces of Reception and Resistance in Latin Lectionaries*

Tuesday, 19 March 2024, 3:00 pm – 3:45 pm

Since all churches adopted feasts that were first celebrated ‘according to time and place’ in late antique Jerusalem, traces of this reception can be identified not only in the Eastern but also in the Western Rites. At the same time, some traditions – particularly the Roman Rite – show remarkable resistance towards this new liturgical style; some of the most significant celebrations were received only through the hybridisation of the Roman inheritance with non-Roman Western traditions in the early mediaeval creation of the Romano-Frankish mixed liturgy and entered the city of Rome only in the second millennium. Nevertheless, references to Jerusalem and mimetic rituals occur also in the formative phase of the Roman liturgy, which calls for a differentiated perception of Christian worship also in late antique and early mediaeval Rome.

---

**Bernard Outtier (Bibliothèque du Caucase, Lavau)**

*Less-Known Lists and Indications of Lessons of the Older Georgian Lectionary*

Tuesday, 19 March 2024, 4:15 pm – 5:00 pm

It has been a great surprise, while preparing the description of the very famous manuscript Ivron Georgian 1, the «Oški Bible» (978), to find some indications of liturgical lessons: they have been indicated in the *Catalogue*. But, looking at them with even more preciseness, it is possible to find

much more indications, pointed out very discreetly: only by the colour of the initial letter or by four points.

The «Oški Bible» contained the Old Testament; what about the Gospels? Interestingly, it is possible to see the same system in manuscripts of the Gospels: we have here the example of one of the oldest dated manuscript of the Gospels, Iviron Georgian 83, dated 913.

Of course, there is much to learn from the manuscripts of the Lectionary – only very few have been edited, many are palimpsests waiting for deciphering. The Kala Lectionary has been partly edited by M. Tarchnischvili: the biblical texts, in that edition, are only present as *incipit* and *desinit*; but the edition is also partial, because of the manuscript, he had in hands only the images of 100 folios out of the 220: the manuscript is more or less mutilated in its second part, but much more can be read than the edited text.

And finally, some lists of lessons or indication of lessons may be useful to complete our knowledge of the old Georgian Lectionary of Jerusalem.